| **Student Name:** Catherine Ho |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In post-colonial states, This house believes that education (e.g. history curricula) should graphically and exclusively focus on the negative impact of colonialism. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  You should make it explicitly clear what these ‘negative impacts’ are. We also said like a crazy amount in the opening. The same vagueness applies with ‘positive impacts’ - be specific and clear.  I think we need to characterise from the get go what is wrong with an education that isn’t focused on the harms of colonialism.  Set-up   * Give me real life historical examples of what this looks like. In debates about historical events, not mentioning any is a red flag for the judge. * This is a vague and abstract set-up, that identifies what it needs to do, but doesn’t actually provide the nitty gritty analysis to support what is being said. * Yes, this is about harms - but what are they? Burdens need to be specific.   Argument 1 - Title? Thesis?   * What countries are we talking about? How and why would they be damaged? The explanations up top of presumably colonialism are being described very vaguely and abstractly; we mention ‘negative relations’ and this country and the other country a lot. * The example of Hong Kong is good, but what negative impact? What are you actually talking about? Is the access to a British passport uniquely good or important or valuable…? This is also exclusive to HK as opposed to literally every other country that was colonised. * What is the impact of this argument?   We needed to argue the following:   * Colonial history often marginalised or erased the narratives of the colonised. A graphic focus on the negative impacts—exploitation, oppression, cultural destruction—serves to rectify this injustice by bringing these experiences to the forefront. This can be a powerful tool for fostering a sense of shared identity and collective memory among the formerly colonised. * What is needed by the population moving forward? How do we create a central national identity? Why is this important? Was there a lot of fragmentation and alienation between ethnic communities during colonisation?   05:53 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Ivy Xu |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In post-colonial states, This house believes that education (e.g. history curricula) should graphically and exclusively focus on the negative impact of colonialism. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good opening; explain how anger worsens problems, relationships and identity.  Clear signposting; the two argument titles sound very similar.  Set-up   * Good on what isn’t contentious - that colonialism was harmful. * Healing - excellent. What does this mean for the education system? What does it teach instead? The positives of colonialism? That colonialism occurred but now it’s done etc.?   Rebuttal   * Clarify the stance and what you do and don’t have to defend here. That you’re not just saying colonialism was justified in class. * We need to characterise the kind of condition the country is in in the post colonial period. Problem characterisation needed.   Arg 1   * Characterise what this education is like! Prop never did it, so you need to explain how exactly this education leads to the very harms you’re talking about. * Is HK the best example to use in the debate? Is it the kind of broken down government in post-colonial African and South Asian states that are the stronger example on our side? * Explain how this hurts the ethnic minorities involved the most/sees them as holdouts re the ones utilised by the colonising class. * You need to give me examples of this hatred and why it is bad; what does it lead to? * Backlash and retaliation in politics is such a generalisation and underexplained. This could have been a massive argument on the political parties and nature of populism in post colonial countries!   Arg 2   * They haven’t actually apologised or provided any monetary reparations I’m afraid. * Do we prove the impact?   This debate should be about the needs of the post colonial country - and how history education plays a massive role in the construction of a national identity and culture.  We cannot giggle or laugh at any point in our speech!  06:15 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Marvis Leung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In post-colonial states, This house believes that education (e.g. history curricula) should graphically and exclusively focus on the negative impact of colonialism. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Excellent opening. Explain to me how this extraction occurs; that is a core-periphery relationship; that economic industrialisation in Western Europe occurred off the backs of colonialism. Explain how history in the status quo is at best an euphemism - we need to free the minds of people + provide them with a way forward.  This debate should be about the needs of the post colonial country - and how history education plays a massive role in the construction of a national identity and culture.  Rebuttal   * We can’t just say no mech, moving on! You have to engage in good faith and first explain why it isn’t true, then not important, then an even if, then a comparative, then weighing. * We need to explain why that anger is important and provides solidarity in national identity. * I think we need to characterise from the get go what is wrong with an education that isn’t focused on the harms of colonialism.   We transitioned into our argument at 1:45. Do we think this is sufficient?  Argument 1   * The HK push isn’t what you say, but that HK was treated excellently in comparison to other colonies. You want to talk about the Indian subcontinent, French rule over Africa etc.   Why do we randomly have clashes?   * What does the manipulation look like? Does it exist in the status quo? * We can talk about how their industries and economies are still extractive.   We needed to argue the following:   * Colonial history often marginalised or erased the narratives of the colonised. A graphic focus on the negative impacts—exploitation, oppression, cultural destruction—serves to rectify this injustice by bringing these experiences to the forefront. This can be a powerful tool for fostering a sense of shared identity and collective memory among the formerly colonised. * What is needed by the population moving forward? How do we create a central national identity? Why is this important? Was there a lot of fragmentation and alienation between ethnic communities during colonisation?   The structure of this speech was all over the place!  05:14 | | | | | | |